



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 12, 2016

Mr. Jeffrey C. Monk
Administration Manager
Public Affairs - Open Records Unit
City of Houston Police Department
1200 Travis
Houston, Texas 77002-6000

OR2016-15666

Dear Mr. Monk:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 617946 (ORU No. 16-2885).

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for seven categories of information related to a specified incident involving named individuals on a specified date. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹ We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note the requested information includes a police officer's body worn camera recording. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661 provides, in relevant part, the following:

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the body worn camera recording at issue was not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

You seek to withhold the submitted information, consisting of a representative sample of an investigation conducted by the department’s internal affairs division, under section 552.101 of the Government Code. You state the rest of the requested information was the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2008-15077 (2008). In that ruling, we determined, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. We have no indication there has been any change in the law, facts, or circumstances on which the previous ruling was based. Accordingly, to the extent the requested information is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by this office, we conclude the department may rely on Open Records Letter No. 2008-15077 as a previous determination and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with that ruling. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). We will address your arguments for the information not at issue in the prior rulings.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code, which provides in relevant part:

(b) The department shall maintain an investigatory file that relates to a disciplinary action against a fire fighter or police officer that was overturned on appeal, or any document in the possession of the department that relates to a charge of misconduct against a fire fighter or police officer, regardless of whether the charge is sustained, only in a file created by the department for the department's use. The department may only release information in those investigatory files or documents relating to a charge of misconduct:

- (1) to another law enforcement agency or fire department;
- (2) to the office of a district or United States attorney; or
- (3) in accordance with Subsection (c).

(c) The department head or the department head's designee may forward a document that relates to disciplinary action against a fire fighter or police officer to the director or the director's designee for inclusion in the fire fighter's or police officer's personnel file maintained under Sections 143.089(a)-(f) only if:

- (1) disciplinary action was actually taken against the fire fighter or police officer;
- (2) the document shows the disciplinary action taken; and
- (3) the document includes at least a brief summary of the facts on which the disciplinary action was based.

Local Gov't Code § 143.1214(b)-(c). You explain the information in Exhibit 2 consists of records of an internal investigation of alleged misconduct on the part of two department police officers. You state the allegations were sustained, disciplinary action was taken, and all documents meeting the requirements of section 143.1214(c) were forwarded to the police officers' personnel files maintained under section 143.089(a) of the Local Government Code. *See id.* § 143.1214(b)(3), (c)(1)-(3). You inform us the information in Exhibit 2 is maintained in the department's investigatory files and is not part of the officers' civil service files.² You assert the requestor is not a representative of another law enforcement agency, a fire department, or the office of a district or United States attorney. *See id.* § 143.1214(b)(1)-(2). Based on your representations and our review, we agree Exhibit 2 is confidential under section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

²You state the department will direct the requestor to the City of Houston Human Resources Department for further responsive information.

In summary, as the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) of the Government Code, the requested body worn camera recording need not be released. The department may continue to rely on Open Records Letter No. 2008-15077 as a previous determination and withhold or release the identical information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code in accordance with that ruling. The department must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ian Lancaster
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

IML/dls

Ref: ID# 617946

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)