



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 18, 2016

Mr. John P. Beauchamp
General Counsel
Texas Commission on Law Enforcement
6330 East Highway 290, Suite 200
Austin, Texas 78723-1035

OR2016-16095

Dear Mr. Beauchamp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID#618790.

The Texas Commission on Law Enforcement (the "commission") received a request for information regarding a specified incident. You state you will release some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a peace officer's commission identification number. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;
 - (B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's commission identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commission's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the commission website. Accordingly, we find the officer's commission identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the commission identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Next, we must address the commission's procedural obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. Gov't Code § 552.301(e). The commission received the request for information on April 28, 2016. Accordingly, you were required to provide the information required by section 552.301(e) by May 19, 2016. The commission timely submitted arguments regarding the applicability of sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code in a letter dated May 11, 2016. However, in a letter dated June 28, 2016, we note the commission submitted an additional brief stating amended reasons why section 552.108 of Government Code applies. Consequently, we find the commission failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301(e) of the Government Code with respect to its amended arguments regarding the applicability of section 552.108.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision

No. 630 (1994). Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by showing the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third-party interests. *See* ORD 630. Although the commission states reasons why section 552.108 of Government Code applies in its amended June 28, 2016, briefing, we note section 552.108 is discretionary in nature. It serves to protect a governmental body's interests and may be waived; as such, it does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information. *See Simmons*, 166 S.W.3d at 350 (section 552.108 is not compelling reason to withhold information under section 552.302); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Accordingly, no portion of the requested information may be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code based on the commission's amended arguments regarding the applicability of this exception. However, we will consider the commission's timely submitted arguments contained in its letter dated May 11, 2016.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. We understand you to raise section 552.101 in conjunction with the common-law informer's privilege, which Texas courts have long recognized. *See Aguilar v. State*, 444 S.W.2d 935, 937 (Tex. Crim. App. 1969). The informer's privilege protects from disclosure the identities of persons who report activities over which the governmental body has criminal or quasi-criminal law-enforcement authority. *See* Open Records Decision No. 208 at 1-2 (1978). The informer's privilege protects the identities of individuals who report violations of statutes to the police or similar law-enforcement agencies, as well as those who report violations of statutes with civil or criminal penalties to "administrative officials having a duty of inspection or of law enforcement within their particular spheres." Open Records Decision No. 279 at 1-2 (1981) (citing 8 John H. Wigmore, *Evidence in Trials at Common Law*, § 2374, at 767 (J. McNaughton Rev. Ed. 1961)). The report must be of a violation of a criminal or civil statute. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 582 at 2 (1990), 515 at 4 (1988). However, witnesses who provide information in the course of an investigation but do not make a report of the violation are not informants for the purposes of claiming the informer's privilege. The privilege excepts the informer's statement only to the extent necessary to protect that informer's identity. Open Records Decision No. 549 at 5 (1990). We note the informer's privilege does not apply where the informant's identity is known to the individual who is the subject of the complaint. *See* ORD 208 at 1-2.

You state portions of the submitted information identify a complainant who reported possible violations of law to the commission's Enforcement Division. We note, however, the privilege is not intended to protect the identities of public officials and employees who have a duty to report violations of the law. In this instance, the informer is a law enforcement officer. Because a public employee acts within the scope of his employment when filing a complaint, the informer's privilege does not protect the public employee's identity. *Cf. United States v. St. Regis Paper Co.*, 328 F. Supp. 660,665 (W.D. Wis. 1971) (concluding

public officer may not claim informer's reward for service it is his or her official duty to perform). Accordingly, the commission may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108 may be invoked by any proper custodian of information relating to a pending investigation or prosecution of criminal conduct. *See* Open Records Decision No. 474 at 4-5 (1987). Where a governmental body has custody of information relating to a pending case of a law enforcement agency, the custodian of the records may withhold the information if it provides this office with a demonstration that the information relates to the pending case and a representation from the law enforcement agency that it wishes to have the information withheld.

You inform our office the commission has closed its case regarding the incident specified in the request. However, you state the licensee at issue in the submitted information "is being investigated by the law enforcement agency" regarding alleged violations of the law. You do not inform us this other law enforcement agency objects to disclosure of the information because its release would interfere with an ongoing criminal investigation. Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is inapplicable to the submitted information. Therefore, the commission may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the commission identification number in the submitted information is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The commission must release the remaining information.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹We note the requestor has a right of access beyond that of the general public to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023; Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Accordingly, if the commission receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the commission must again seek a ruling from this office.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'KM' followed by a long horizontal stroke.

Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KSM/dls

Ref: ID# 618790

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)