



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 19, 2016

Ms. Dawn Roberts
Assistant City Attorney
Arlington Police Department
Mail Stop 04-0200
P.O. Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004-1065

OR2016-16295

Dear Ms. Roberts:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 625107 (Police Dept. Reference No. 27728).

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section also encompasses information protected by section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information does not identify a juvenile suspect or offender for purposes of section 58.007. Accordingly, we find the department has not demonstrated the applicability of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code to the submitted information. Thus, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. We note the requestor may be the authorized representative of the individual whose privacy interest is at issue; thus, the requestor may have a right of access to this individual’s private information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.023(b)

¹Section 552.102(a) exempts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” *Gov’t Code* § 552.102(a).

(governmental body may not deny access to person or person's representative to whom information relates on grounds that information is considered confidential under privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Because we are unable to determine whether the requestor is the authorized representative of the individual whose privacy interest is at issue, we must rule conditionally. If the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, then the department may not withhold his date of birth in the submitted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. If the requestor is not acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, then the department must withhold his date of birth in the submitted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.² See Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the remaining information contains motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130. However, we note section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals and the requestor may be acting as the authorized representative of the individual whose motor vehicle record information is at issue. Accordingly, the requestor may have a right of access to this individual's motor vehicle record information under section 552.023 of the Government Code. See *id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, we must rule conditionally. If the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, the department may not withhold his motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 and must release this information to the requestor. If, however, the requestor is not acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, the department must withhold the submitted motor vehicle record information under section 552.130.

In summary, if the requestor is not acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, then the department must withhold his date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. If the requestor is not acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, the department must withhold the submitted motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Thompson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PT/dls

Ref: ID# 625107

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)