



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 20, 2016

Mr. Guillermo Trevino  
Assistant City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
City of Fort Worth  
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor  
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2016-16299

Dear Mr. Trevino:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 619132 (Fort Worth Reference No. W051399).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified individual. We understand the city will redact information pursuant to sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code and Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).<sup>1</sup> Further, we understand you will withhold information pursuant to the

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact the social security number of a living person without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See id.* § 552.147(b). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2016-00620 (2016).<sup>2</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual’s criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find the present request requires the city to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. Accordingly, we find the request implicates the named individual’s right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, the city has submitted reports which do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual. Thus, this information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy as a criminal history compilation. Accordingly, we will address the city’s argument against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c). Section 58.007 provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise,

---

<sup>2</sup>Open Records Letter No. 2016-00620 is a previous determination issued to the City of Fort Worth authorizing it to withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office.

concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we conclude the information in Exhibit C-2 consists of law enforcement records involving juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision occurring after September 1, 1997, and is, therefore, subject to section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007). None of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, the information in Exhibit C-2 is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

- (a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:
  - (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and
  - (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

*Id.* § 261.201(a). The city contends the information in Exhibit C-3 is confidential under section 261.201. However, we find the city has failed to demonstrate the submitted information involves a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect of a child made under chapter 261 or the information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* §§ 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code), 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Therefore, the city may not withhold the information in Exhibit C-3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

As stated above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects the specific types of information the Texas Supreme Court held to be intimate or embarrassing in *Industrial Foundation*. 540 S.W.2d at 682. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we conclude the most of the information you have marked meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, we find no portion of the remaining information at issue, which we have marked for release, is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Accordingly, except for the information we have marked for release, the city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information in Exhibit C-2 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. Except for the information we have marked for release, the city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cristian Rosas-Grillet  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CRG/bw

Ref: ID# 619132

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)