



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 21, 2016

Ms. Katie Leininger
Assistant City Attorney
City Attorney's Office
City of Pearland
3519 Liberty Drive
Pearland, Texas 77581

OR2016-16505

Dear Ms. Leininger:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 625712.

The Pearland Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified report. You state the department has released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 522.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply not later than the tenth business day after the date of receiving the written request. *See Gov't Code* § 552.301(b). You state the department received the request for information on October 29, 2012. Thus, the

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988)*. This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

department's ten-business-day deadline was June 28, 2016. However, the envelope in which the department sent its request for a ruling is post-marked June 29, 2016. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301(b) of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 (1994), 586 (1991), 319 (1982). This office has held a compelling reason exists to withhold information when third-party interests are at stake or when information is made confidential by another source of law. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977) (construing predecessor statute). Although the department claims the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code, these sections are discretionary exceptions to disclosure that protect a governmental body's interests and may be waived; as such, they do not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S. W.3d 469,475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 522 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general). Because the department failed to comply with section 552.301, the department has waived its claim under sections 552.103 and 552.108. Accordingly, none of the remaining information may be withheld under sections 552.103 and 552.108 based on the department's own interests. However, the need of a governmental body other than the agency that is seeking an open records decision to withhold information under section 552.108 can provide a compelling reason to withhold information from disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 3 (1991). In this instance, we have received correspondence from the Brazoria County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objecting to the release of the information at issue. Accordingly, we will consider whether the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108 on behalf of the district attorney's office. Additionally, as section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the applicability of this section to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to

or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

Here, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although the district attorney's office asserts section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the department must release the accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and submit documentation demonstrating, the district attorney's office objects to the release of the remaining information because it pertains to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*, 531 S.W.2d at 186–87. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3–4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which the department must release, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

In summary, the department must release the accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/bhf

Ref: ID# 625712

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)