



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 5, 2016

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1440 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2016-17680

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 623263 (ORR# 2016-06528).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for police reports for unfounded rape cases during a specified time frame. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹Although you do not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings. You acknowledge, and we agree, the department did not comply with the requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). However, sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code are mandatory exceptions that can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness caused by a failure to comply with section 552.301. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302. Thus, we will consider the department's claims.

²We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Some of the submitted information consists of information used or developed in investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. Because you do not indicate the department has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the information at issue is confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).* Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you have marked and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other

³As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your other arguments to withhold this information.

sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d at 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Further, in considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.⁴ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3.

Upon review, we find some of the remaining information meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, the remaining information you have marked pertains to individuals who have been de-identified and whose privacy interests are thus protected. The department may not withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you have marked and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information you have marked and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. With the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you have marked and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction

⁴Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Brian E. Berger
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BB/akg

Ref: ID# 623263

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)