



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 8, 2016

Ms. Julie Pandya Doshier
General Counsel for the City of Highland Village
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.
1800 Ross Tower
500 North Akard
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2016-17740

Dear Ms. Doshier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 621858 (File Reference No. 77167).

The Highland Village Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for thirteen categories of information related to a specified motor vehicle accident. You state you will release basic information in accordance with section 552.108(c) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered basic information). You state you will redact information pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information does not pertain to the motor vehicle accident specified in the request. Accordingly, this information, which we have indicated, is not responsive to the instant request. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the department is not required to release such information in response to this request.

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Next, we address your contention that article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure does not make the submitted affidavit maintained by the department expressly public. Article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure Provides in relevant part:

The arrest warrant, and any affidavit presented to the magistrate in support of the issuance of the warrant, is public information, and beginning immediately when the warrant is executed the magistrate's clerk shall make a copy of the warrant and the affidavit available for public inspection in the clerk's office during normal business hours.

Crim Proc. Code art. 15.26. Thus, we interpret article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure to apply only to court clerks. Accordingly, article 15.26 does not make the submitted affidavit maintained by the department expressly public. Accordingly, we will address your arguments under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 for the submitted affidavit, as well as the remaining information.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information you have marked relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of*

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of the submitted information.

Texas, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.³ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must withhold the dates of birth you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. You state you will redact motor vehicle record information under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.⁴ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find a portion of the information you have marked does not constitute motor vehicle record information. The department may not withhold the information at issue, which we have marked for release, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Accordingly, except for the information we have marked for release, we find the department must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the dates of birth you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Except for the information we have marked for release, we find the department must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining responsive information must be released.⁵

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

⁴Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

⁵Because the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released, the department must again seek a ruling from this office if it receives a request for this information from a different requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Transp. Code § 550.065(c).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kavid Singh
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KVS/bhf

Ref: ID# 621858

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)