



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 8, 2016

Ms. Alexis G. Allen  
Counsel for the City of Red Oak  
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.  
1800 Ross Tower  
500 North Akard Street  
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2016-17822

Dear Ms. Allen:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 621704 (City File No. 77179).

The Red Oak Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for twenty-one categories of information pertaining to a specified case involving the requestor's client. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(h) This section does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under Chapter 42, Human Resources Code.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (h). You assert the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201(a). Upon review, however, we find the submitted information pertains to an investigation of alleged abuse or neglect that occurred in a child care facility that is regulated by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code. Section 261.201 does not apply to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under chapter 42. *Id.* § 261.201(h). Thus, section 261.201(a) of the Family Code is not applicable to the submitted information and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note the submitted information includes a citation. Because a copy of the citation has been provided to the individual who was cited, we find that release of the citation will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1)*. Therefore, the department may not withhold the citation under section 552.108(a)(1). You state the remaining information pertains to a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. However, the basic information does not include motor

vehicle record information encompassed by section 552.130 of the Government Code or the social security number of the complainant. *See id.* Thus, with the exception of the citation and basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.<sup>2</sup> *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3. Thus, the department must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked in the citation under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the citation under section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

The department claims section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 730.004 of the Transportation Code. Section 552.101 also encompasses section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides "an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record." Transp. Code § 730.004. "Personal information" includes a person's name, address, and driver identification number, but not the zip code. *Id.* § 730.003(6). The

---

<sup>1</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

<sup>2</sup>Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) is an “agency” for purposes of chapter 730. *See id.* § 730.003(1) (“agency” is state agency that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records). You state some of the remaining information was obtained by the department from DPS. *See id.* § 730.007(a)(2)(A)(I) (personal information may be disclosed to government agency in carrying out its functions). An authorized recipient of personal information may not re-disclose the personal information, and to do so is a misdemeanor offense. *Id.* § 730.013(a), (d). Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the names and addresses, but not the zip codes, of any individuals whose personal information it received from DPS under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 730.004 and 730.013 of the Transportation Code. However, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

In summary, with the exception of the citation and basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the citation, the department must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold from the remaining information the names and addresses, but not the zip codes, of any individuals whose personal information it obtained from the DPS under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 730.004 and 730.013 of the Transportation Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nicholas A. Ybarra  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

NAY/bw

Ref: ID# 621704

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)