



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 1, 2016

Ms. Amy L. Sims
Assistant City Attorney
City of Lubbock
P.O. Box 2000
Lubbock, Texas 79457

OR2016-19837

Dear Ms. Sims:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 624896 (File No. 1365).

The Lubbock Police Department (the "department") received a request for 18 categories of information pertaining to a specified motor vehicle accident, including certain policies and procedures. You state the department does not maintain information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you state some of the requested information was the subject of a previous request for a ruling, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2016-12673 (2016). In that ruling, we determined the City of Lubbock (1) may withhold the marked information under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code, and (2) must release the

¹The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

²Although you also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code, you make no arguments to support this exception. Therefore, we assume you have withdrawn your claim that this section applies to the submitted information. *See Gov't Code* §§ 552.301, .302.

remaining information. We have no indication the law, facts, or circumstances on which the prior ruling was based have not changed. Thus, for the requested information identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by this office, the department may rely on Open Records Letter No. 2016-12673 as a previous determination and withhold or release the information at issue in accordance with that ruling. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in a prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). We will consider your argument against disclosure of the submitted information, which you state was not previously ruled on.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator’s accident report), .062 (officer’s accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

The submitted information includes a CR-3 accident report. Here, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although you assert section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act’s general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor’s statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the accident report under section 552.108. Thus, the department must release the accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A);

Open Records Decision No. 434 (1986). You state the submitted information pertains to criminal investigations that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may rely on Open Records Letter No. 2016-12673 as a previous determination and withhold or release the information at issue in accordance with that ruling. The department must release the accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c). With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Matthew Taylor
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHT/dls

Ref: ID# 624896

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)