



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 7, 2016

Ms. Nicole McDaniel
Support Services Supervisor
Crowley Police Department
617 Business FM 1187 West
Crowley, Texas 76036

OR20116-20112

Dear Ms. McDaniel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 626452.

The Crowley Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified report. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The

¹Although you do not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings.

supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Thus, the department must generally withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. In this instance, the requestor represents an insurance provider and may be acting as the authorized representative of one of the individuals whose motor vehicle record information is at issue. To the extent the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of an individual whose motor vehicle record information is at issue, the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 to information pertaining to that individual that would otherwise be protected under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, to the extent the requestor has a right of access to the motor vehicle record information you have marked such information may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must generally withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; however, if the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of one of the individuals whose motor vehicle record information is at issue, the department must release that individual's motor vehicle record information to the requestor. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "N.A. Ybarra". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "N.A." and the last name "Ybarra" clearly distinguishable.

Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/bw

Ref: ID# 626452

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)