



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 12, 2016

Ms. Yvette Aguilar
Assistant City Attorney
City of Corpus Christi
P. O. Box 9277
Corpus Christi, Texas 78469-9277

OR2016-20495

Dear Ms. Aguilar:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 625902.

The Corpus Christi Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to two named individuals. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted

that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person does not implicate the privacy interest of the individual and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf.* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information).

The present request seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to the named individuals. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the individuals' rights to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, you have submitted records relating to routine traffic violations and information that does not list the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and, thus, does not implicate the individuals' rights to privacy. Accordingly, we will consider your arguments for this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). The information you have marked was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of Family Code chapter 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Accordingly, we find this information falls within the scope of

section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information; therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (addressing predecessor statute).

You claim report numbers 16006290017 and 95-068445 are confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct by a child that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. Fam. Code § 58.007(c). The relevant portion of section 58.007 provides:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). *See also id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” as a person who is ten years of age or older and younger than seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct). Upon review, we find report number 16006290017 involves delinquent conduct by a child that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of section 58.007). Further, it does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, report number 16006290017 is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, we note section 58.007 is inapplicable to report number 95-068445 because the conduct at issue occurred in 1995. Accordingly, we will address the applicability of former section 51.14 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code. Prior to its repeal by the Seventy-Fourth Legislature, former section 51.14

provided for the confidentiality of juvenile law enforcement records. *See* Open Records Decision No. 181 (1977) (concluding that former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code excepts police reports which identify juvenile suspects or furnish basis for their identification). Law enforcement records pertaining to juvenile conduct occurring before January 1, 1996 are governed by former section 51.14(d), which was continued in effect for that purpose. *See* Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 262, § 100, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 2517, 2591. Former section 51.14 provided in pertinent part:

(d) Except as provided by Article 15.27, Code of Criminal Procedure, and except for files and records relating to a charge for which a child is transferred under Section 54.02 of this code to a criminal court for prosecution, the law-enforcement files and records are not open to public inspection nor may their contents be disclosed to the public, but inspection of the files and records is permitted by:

- (1) a juvenile court having the child before it in any proceeding;
- (2) an attorney for a party to the proceeding; and
- (3) law-enforcement officers when necessary for the discharge of their official duties.

Fam. Code § 51.14(d) (repealed 1995). A “child” is defined as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find report number 95-068445 pertains to conduct that occurred prior to January 1, 1996. However, we are unable to determine the age of the alleged offenders at the time of the incidents in question. Therefore, we must rule conditionally. The requestor does not fall within the categories in former section 51.14(d) under which inspection of the records would be permitted. *See* Act of May 22, 1993, 73d Leg., R.S., ch. 461, § 3, 1993 Tex. Gen. Laws 1850, 1852 (repealed 1995) (formerly Fam. Code § 51.14(d)(1), (2), (3)). Accordingly, to the extent any of the alleged offenders were ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct, report number 95-068445 is confidential pursuant to former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, to the extent the alleged offenders were not ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct, report number 95-068445 is not confidential pursuant to former section 51.14(d) and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

We note portions of the remaining information are subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code, including report number 95-068445 to the extent it is not confidential pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former

section 51.14(d) of the Family Code.¹ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

As noted above section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information you have marked in the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The department must withhold report number 16006290017 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

To the extent any of the alleged offenders in report number 95-068445 were ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct, the department must withhold the report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Britni Ramirez". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looping "R" at the end.

Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/eb

Ref: ID# 625902

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)