



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 13, 2016

Mr. Robert G. Schleier, Jr.
Counsel for the City of Kilgore
Law Office of Robert G. Schleier, Jr., P.C.
116 North Kilgore Street
Kilgore, Texas 75662

OR2016-20666

Dear Mr. Schleier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 626283.

The Kilgore Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified arrest. You state the department has released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, article 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, as added by House Bill 3791 by the 84th Texas Legislature,¹ provides:

A person stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under Section 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, or 49.08, Penal Code, is entitled to receive from a law enforcement agency employing the peace officer who made the stop or arrest a copy of any video made by or at the direction of the officer that contains footage of:

(1) the stop;

¹Act of May 30, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1124, § 1 (codified at Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.139).

- (2) the arrest;
- (3) the conduct of the person stopped during any interaction with the officer, including during the administration of a field sobriety test; or
- (4) a procedure in which a specimen of the person's breath or blood is taken.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.139. The submitted information contains video recordings that were made by or at the direction of an officer employed by the department and contain footage of the requestor being stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code. *See* Penal Code § 49.04 (“A person commits an offense if the person is intoxicated while operating a motor vehicle in a public place.”). Although the department asserts section 552.108 to withhold this information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act’s general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor’s statutory access under article 2.139 prevails. Therefore, the department may not withhold the recording at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the requestor is generally entitled to receive a copy of the video recording at issue pursuant to article 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Next, we note the remaining information includes the breath test results of an arrestee’s blood alcohol content. Full information concerning the analysis of the specimen must be made available upon the request of the person who has given the specimen at the request of a peace officer. *See* Transp. Code § 724.018. Here, the requestor is the individual who submitted the specimen. You seek to withhold this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, as noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the exceptions to public disclosure under the Act. *See* ORDs 613 at 4, 451. Therefore, the department may not withhold the breath test results under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the department must release the breath test results to this requestor pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code.

Next, we note the remaining information includes court-filed documents. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of “information that is also contained in a public court record[,]” unless the information is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). The department seeks to withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body’s interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold the court-filed documents under

section 552.108. However, we will address the department's arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information pertains to a case in which the requestor received deferred adjudication and was placed on probation for one year. Thus, you argue the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(1) until the probation term has been completed. Upon review, however, we find as the defendant has entered a plea and received a sentence, neither the investigation nor prosecution on the matter is pending. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, we find you have not demonstrated section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information, and the department may not withhold the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”² Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code § 552.130*. Upon review, we find portions of the submitted video recordings consist of motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130. Thus, with the exception of motor vehicle record information belonging to the requestor, to which the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the department must generally withhold any discernible motor vehicle record information within the submitted video recordings under section 552.130. *See Gov't Code § 552.023(a)* ("person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself).

As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See ORDs 613 at 4, 451*. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 and the right of access provided under article 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Gov't Code § 311.026(b)*; *Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 211 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context, while article 2.139 specifically provides access to certain video footage pertaining to certain intoxication offense arrests. Thus, we conclude the access provided under article 2.139 to the video recording containing footage of the requestor being stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Additionally, we note article 2.139 is the later enacted statute. *See Gov't Code § 311.025(a)* (if statutes enacted at different sessions of legislature are irreconcilable, statute latest in enactment prevails). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the video recording to which the requestor has access pursuant to article 2.139 under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, pursuant to article 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, the department must release the entireties of the video recordings containing footage of the requestor being

stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code. The department must release the breath test results to this requestor pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The department must withhold all discernible motor vehicle record information not belonging to the requestor within the remaining video recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 626283

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, if the department receives another request for the same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a decision from this office.