



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 13, 2016

Mr. William Christian
Counsel for Del Mar College
Graves, Dougherty, Hearon & Moody, P.C.
P.O. Box 98
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2016-20673

Dear Mr. Christian:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 626369 (DMC 016-020).

The Del Mar College District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for specified invoices and reports, a contract, and a specified code of ethics signed by named employees. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.107 and 552.116 of the Government Code and privileged under Texas Rule of Evidence 503.¹ We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Initially, we note the information in Exhibit A is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

¹Although the district raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Texas Rule of Evidence 503, this office has concluded section 552.101 does not encompass discovery privileges. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 1-2 (2002), 575 at 2 (1990).

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(16) information that is in a bill for attorney's fees and that is not privileged under the attorney-client privilege[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(16). Exhibit A contains attorney fee bills that are subject to section 552.022(a)(16). This information must be released unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* Although you raise section 552.107 of the Government Code for the attorney fee bills in Exhibit A, this section is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 10-11 (attorney-client privilege under Gov't Code § 552.107(1) may be waived), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions).* Therefore, the district may not withhold the attorney fee bills in Exhibit A under section 552.107 of the Government Code. However, the Texas Supreme Court has held the Texas Rules of Evidence are "other law" within the meaning of section 552.022. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). Accordingly, we will address your claim of the attorney-client privilege under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence for the attorney fee bills in Exhibit A. We will also consider your argument under section 552.116 of the Government Code for the information not subject to section 552.022.

Texas Rule of Evidence 503(b)(1) provides the following:

A client has a privilege to refuse to disclose and to prevent any other person from disclosing confidential communications made to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services to the client:

(A) between the client or the client's representative and the client's lawyer or the lawyer's representative;

(B) between the client's lawyer and the lawyer's representative;

(C) by the client, the client's representative, the client's lawyer, or the lawyer's representative to a lawyer representing another party in a pending action or that lawyer's representative, if the communications concern a matter of common interest in the pending action;

(D) between the client's representatives or between the client and the client's representative; or

(E) among lawyers and their representatives representing the same client.

Tex. R. Evid. 503(b)(1). A communication is “confidential” if not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made to further the rendition of professional legal services to the client or reasonably necessary to transmit the communication. *Id.* 503(a)(5).

Accordingly, in order to withhold attorney-client privileged information from disclosure under Rule 503, a governmental body must 1) show that the document is a communication transmitted between privileged parties or reveals a confidential communication; 2) identify the parties involved in the communication; and 3) show that the communication is confidential by explaining that it was not intended to be disclosed to third persons and that it was made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client. *See* ORD 676. Upon a demonstration of all three factors, the entire communication is confidential under Rule 503 provided the client has not waived the privilege or the communication does not fall within the purview of the exceptions to the privilege enumerated in Rule 503(d). *Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein); *In re Valero Energy Corp.*, 973 S.W.2d 453, 457 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1998, orig. proceeding) (privilege attaches to complete communication, including factual information).

You assert portions of the submitted fee bills contain communications between the district and outside counsel for the district that were made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services. The district does not indicate it has waived the attorney-client privilege with regard to the communications. Upon review, we find the district has established some of the information, which we have marked, constitutes attorney-client communications under Texas Rule of Evidence 503. Accordingly, the district may withhold the information we have marked under Texas Rule of Evidence 503. However, the remaining information either reveals a communication with a party who is not identified as privileged or is not a communication. We note an entry stating a memorandum or e-mail was prepared or drafted does not demonstrate the document was communicated to the client. Accordingly, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to the remaining information at issue. Thus, the remaining information may not be withheld under Texas Rule of Evidence 503.

Section 552.116 of the Government Code provides,

(a) An audit working paper of an audit of the state auditor or the auditor of a state agency, an institution of higher education as defined by Section 61.003, Education Code, a county, a municipality, a school district, a hospital district, or a joint board operating under Section 22.074, Transportation Code, including any audit relating to the criminal history

background check of a public school employee, is excepted from [required public disclosure]. If information in an audit working paper is also maintained in another record, that other record is not excepted from [public disclosure] by this section.

(b) In this section:

(1) "Audit" means an audit authorized or required by a statute of this state or the United States, the charter or an ordinance of a municipality, an order of the commissioners court of a county, the bylaws adopted by or other action of the governing board of a hospital district, a resolution or other action of a board of trustees of a school district, including an audit by the district relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, or a resolution or other action of a joint board described by Subsection (a) and includes an investigation.

(2) "Audit working paper" includes all information, documentary or otherwise, prepared or maintained in conducting an audit or preparing an audit report, including:

(A) intra-agency and interagency communications; and

(B) drafts of the audit report or portions of those drafts.

Gov't Code § 552.116. The district asserts Exhibit B consists of audit working papers pertaining to an audit conducted by the district. The district states the audit is authorized by the district's Board of Regents. *See id.* § 552.116(b)(1). Based on these representations and our review, we agree the information in Exhibit B constitutes audit working papers. Therefore, the district may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.116 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states "Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential."³ *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470(1987).

In summary, the district may withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit A pursuant to rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. The district may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.116 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kavid Singh
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KVS/dls

Ref: ID# 626369

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)