

PRESIDENT

Jeff Landry

Louisiana Attorney General

PRESIDENT-ELECT
Tim Fox
Montana Attorney General

VICE PRESIDENT Karl A. Racine District of Columbia Attorney General

IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT
Derek Schmidt
Kansas Attorney General

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Chris Toth

May 23, 2019

Rep. Jerrold Nadler

Chair

House Committee on the Judiciary 2138 Rayburn House Office Bldg. Washington, DC 20515

Sen. Lindsey Graham

Chair

Senate Committee on the Judiciary 224 Dirksen Senate Office Bldg. Washington, DC 20510

Rep. Frank Pallone, Jr.

Chair

House Committee on Energy

and Commerce

2125 Rayburn House Office Bldg.

Washington, DC 20515

Sen. Roger Wicker

Chair

Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation 512 Dirksen Senate Bldg. Washington, DC 20510 Rep. Doug Collins Ranking Member

House Committee on the Judiciary 2138 Rayburn House Office Bldg. Washington, DC 20515

Sen. Dianne Feinstein Ranking Member

Senate Committee on the Judiciary 224 Dirksen Senate Office Bldg.

Washington, DC 20510

Rep. Greg Walden Ranking Member

House Committee on Energy

and Commerce 2322 Rayburn Bldg. Washington, DC 20515

Sen. Maria Cantwell Ranking Member

Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation 512 Dirksen Senate Bldg. Washington, DC 20510

RE: Amendment of Communications Decency Act (CDA)

Dear Congressional Leaders:

In 2013 and again in 2017, Attorneys General from virtually every state and territory wrote to inform Congress of a damaging misinterpretation and misapplication of Section 230 of the Communications Decency Act of 1996 (CDA) that rendered state and local authorities unable to enforce criminal laws against companies that actively profited from the promotion and facilitation of sex trafficking and crimes against children. To be sure, we are grateful for all the work you have done to protect the vulnerable among us. To bootstrap your efforts, we renew our recommendation for a modest but necessary amendment to the CDA. We must enable our state and local authorities to protect our citizens, including the most vulnerable among us, and to take appropriate action against criminal actors.

1850 M Street, NW Twelfth Floor Washington, DC 20036 Phone: (202) 326-6000 http://www.naag.org/ As noted in our earlier letters, some federal court opinions have interpreted the CDA so broadly that the perverse result has been to protect individuals and services that knowingly aid and profit from illegal activity online at the expense of the victims for whom the protection was intended. To that end, the impropriety of Section 230's application to businesses that profited from the knowing promotion and facilitation of sex trafficking and crimes against children prompted Congress to enact the "Stop Enabling Sex Traffickers Act" and "Allow States and Victims to Fight Online Sex Trafficking Act" (known as FOSTA-SESTA). This bill, signed into law in 2018, provides that the CDA's immunity does not apply to enforcement of federal *or state* sex trafficking laws.

While we welcome the ability to pursue some of the Internet's most pernicious actors under FOSTA-SESTA, we sadly note that the abuse on these platforms does not stop at sex trafficking. Stories of online black market opioid sales, ID theft, deep fakes, election meddling, and foreign intrusion are now ubiquitous, and these growing phenomena will undoubtedly serve as the subjects of hearings throughout the 116<sup>th</sup> Congress. Current precedent interpreting the CDA, however, continues to preclude states and territories from enforcing their criminal laws against companies that, while not actually performing these unlawful activities, provide platforms that make these activities possible. Worse, the extensive safe harbor conferred to these platforms by courts promotes an online environment where these pursuits remain attractive and profitable to all involved, including the platforms that facilitate them.

Addressing criminal activity cannot be relegated to federal enforcement alone simply because the activity occurs online. The authorities in our states must be allowed to address these crimes themselves and fulfill our primary mandate to protect our citizens and enforce their rights. We therefore renew our recommendation that 47 U.S.C. § 230(e)(1) be amended to the following (added language in **bold**):

Nothing in this section shall be construed to impair the enforcement of section 223 or 231 of this title, chapter 71 (relating to obscenity) or 110 (relating to sexual exploitation of children) of title 18, or any other Federal, **State, or Territorial** criminal statute.

In its passage of FOSTA-SESTA, Congress understood that the immense challenges presented by sex trafficking on the Internet must be shared by Federal *and* State authorities. The increasing challenges presented by profiteers of the many other criminal enterprises online require the same level of investigation and prosecution that can only come from inclusion of State and Local resources. We ask that you adopt this simple addition to the CDA to remove the law's restrictions on enforcement and enable us to better protect citizens nationwide.

Respectfully,

Mississippi Attorney General

Ken Paxton

**Texas Attorney General** 

Heven I Marshall

Steve Marshall Alabama Attorney General

Leslie Rutledge Arkansas Attorney General

William Tong

Connecticut Attorney General

Karl A. Racine

District of Columbia Attorney General

Christopher M. Carr Georgia Attorney General

Clare E. Connors Hawaii Attorney General

Curtis T. Hill, Jr.

Indiana Attorney General

Andy Beshear

Kentucky Attorney General

anon M. Frey

Aaron M. Frey

Maine Attorney General

Kevin G. Clarkson

Alaska Attorney General

Phil Weiser

Colorado Attorney General

Wester

Kathleen Jennings

Delaware Attorney General

Ashley Moody

Florida Attorney General

Leevin Taitano Camacho Guam Attorney General

Lawrence Wasden Idaho Attorney General

Derek Schmidt

Kansas Attorney General

enk Schmilt

Brien & frank

Jeff Landry

Louisiana Attorney General

Brian Frosh

Maryland Attorney General

Maura Healey

Massachusetts Attorney General

Dana Nessel

Michigan Attorney General

tuna Wessel

Keith Ellison

Minnesota Attorney General

Eric S. Schmitt

Missouri Attorney General

Tim Fox

Montana Attorney General

Douglas Peterson

Nebraska Attorney General

Aaron D. Ford

Nevada Attorney General

Gordon MacDonald

New Hampshire Attorney General

Gurbir S. Grewal

New Jersey Attorney General

**Hector Balderas** 

New Mexico Attorney General

Letitia James

New York Attorney General

Josh Stein

North Carolina Attorney General

vne Stenehjem

North Dakota Attorney General

Dave Yost

Ohio Attorney General

Mike Hunter

Oklahoma Attorney General

Josh Shapiro

Pennsylvania Attorney General

Wanda Vazquez Garced

Puerto Rico Attorney General

Peter F. Neronha

Rhode Island Attorney General

alan Wilson

Alan Wilson

South Carolina Attorney General

Herbert H. Slatery III

Tennessee Attorney General

T.J. Donovan

Vermont Attorney General

Robert W. Ferguson

Washington Attorney General

oshua J. Kail

Joshua L. Kaul

Wisconsin Attorney General

CC House Committee on the Judiciary Members

Senate Committee on the Judiciary Members

House Committee on Energy and Commerce Members

Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation Members

Jason R. Ravnsborg South Dakota Attorney General

Sean Reyes

Utah Attorney General

Mark R. Herring

Virginia Attorney General

PATRICK Momsey

Patrick Morrisey

West Virginia Attorney General